

Review of Board of Trustees Draft Minutes 11-12-24

What follows is the actual cut and pasted draft minutes from the two meetings of November 12, 2024 with my editorial comments added.

- Link to Video - 3:38 (long meeting) [Board of Trustees - Nov. 12, 2024](#)
- Link to Draft Minutes – Special Meeting [753105594.pdf \(with closed session\)](#)
- Link to Draft Minutes – Regular Meeting [753105523.pdf](#)

The Special Board of Trustees meeting was called to order by Supervisor Buxar called at 6:32 PM on November 12th, 2024 at Oakland Township Hall, 4393 Collins Rd., Rochester, MI.

I. Pledge of Allegiance and Roll Call

Present: Supervisor Buxar
Clerk Mabry
Treasurer Giannangeli
Trustee Elder (arrived at 6:39 p.m.)
Trustee Langlois
Trustee Mangiapane
Trustee Zale

Absent: None

Also present: Joseph Merucci, Township Manager
Dr. Henry Carels, Library Board Member
Morgan Martin, Township Attorney

II. Amendments to the Agenda/Approval of the Agenda

Motion by Zale, seconded by Langlois to approve the agenda as presented.

Motion carried 6/0.

Motion by Mabry, seconded by Mangiapane to allow Dr. Henry Carels to attend closed session.

Motion carried 6/0.

III. Pending Business

1. Consideration of moving into closed session to discuss attorney's opinion regarding the Rochester Hills Public Library agreement, as allowed by MCL 15.243 (1)(h).

Motion by Zale, seconded by Langlois to approve going into closed session to discuss attorney's opinion regarding the Rochester Hills Public Library agreement, as allowed by MCL 15.243 (1)(h).

.....

Editor's note: I don't think MCL15.243 (1)(h) is the correct reason for this or any other closed session. I think they should have cited MCL 15.268 (1)(h). See both below.

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT (EXCERPT)

Act 442 of 1976

15.243 Exemptions from disclosure; public body as school district, intermediate school district, or public school academy; withholding of information required by law or in possession of executive office.

(1) A public body may exempt from disclosure as a public record under this act any of the following:

(h) Information or records subject to the physician-patient privilege, the psychologist-patient privilege, the minister, priest, or Christian Science practitioner privilege, or other privilege recognized by statute or court rule.

OPEN MEETINGS ACT

Act 267 of 1976

15.268 Closed sessions; permissible purposes; applicability to independent citizens redistricting commission.

(1) Except as otherwise provided in subsection (2), a public body may meet in a closed session only for the following purposes:

(h) To consider material exempt from discussion or disclosure by state or federal statute.

.....

Board of Trustees Special Meeting
November 12th, 2024
DRAFT

Roll call vote

Ayes: Buxar, Mabry, Giannangeli, Langlois, Mangiapane, Zale

Nayes:

Absent: Elder

Motion carried 6/0.

IV. Meeting Reconvened

Meeting reconvened at 6:59 p.m.

V. Public Comment for items not on the Agenda

There were none.

VI. Adjournment

Motion by Zale, seconded by Mabry to adjourn the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

Motion carried 7/0.

The next Regular Board of Trustees meeting will be held on Tuesday, December 12th, 2024 at 7:00 PM at the Oakland Township Hall Board Room, 4393 Collins Road, Rochester, MI.

Respectfully Submitted,

Dave Mabry
Clerk

Approved,

Robin Buxar
Supervisor

Board of Trustees Regular Meeting
November 12th, 2024
DRAFT

The Regular Board of Trustees meeting was called to order by Supervisor Buxar called at 7:06 PM on November 12th, 2024 at Oakland Township Hall, 4393 Collins Rd., Rochester, MI.

I. Pledge of Allegiance and Roll Call

Present: Supervisor Buxar
Clerk Mabry
Treasurer Giannangeli
Trustee Elder
Trustee Langlois
Trustee Mangiapane
Trustee Zale

Absent: None

Also present: Joseph Merucci, Township Manager
Meggan Brown, Deputy Clerk
Brittany Ellis, Township Attorney

II. Announcements and Proclamations

There were none.

III. Amendments to the Agenda/Approval of the Agenda

Motion by Mabry, seconded by Elder, to change the wording of agenda item #6 to:

Discussion of the November 2nd, 2024 posting regarding allegations against the Oakland Township Clerks Department by a member of the Board of Trustees.

Motion was amended by Mabry, seconded by Elder to change the wording of agenda item #6 to:

Review of the November 2nd, 2024 posting.

Roll Call Vote

Ayes: Buxar, Mabry, Elder, Zale

Nayes: Mangiapane, Langlois, Giannangeli

Absent: None

Motion carried 4/3.

Motion by Elder, seconded by Zale to approve the agenda as amended.

Board of Trustees Regular Meeting
November 12th, 2024
DRAFT

Roll Call Vote

Ayes: Buxar, Elder, Zale, Mabry, Langlois, Giannangeli
Nayes: Mangiapane
Absent: None

Motion caried 6/1.

.....

Editor's note: The original agenda item was worded as follows: “**6. Review of November 2, 2024, posting and publication of allegation against a Board of Trustees member by the Oakland Township Clerk.**”

.....

IV. Public Comment for Items on the Agenda

John Markel 245 Birch Hill Drive - Thanked Veteran's for their service, welcomed returning and new Board of Trustee members, and thanked those leaving for their service.

Frank Ferriolo – Thanked Trustee Zale for serving on the Board of Trustees.

Bob Yager 1127 Bear Creek Court - Spoke regarding the Collins Road traffic study. He also thanked our Veterans and Board of Trustee members Zale and Mangiapane.

.....

Editor's note: Should read “**...for items not on the agenda...**”

.....

V. **Consent Agenda**

Motion by Mabry, seconded by Elder to approve the consent agenda as presented.
Motion carried 7/0.

.....

Editor's note: The consent agenda - (clipped from the agenda)

V. **Consent Agenda:**

1. Approval of Bills
 - a. November 12, 2024, invoices in the amount of \$777,258.96.
2. Payroll via ACH
 - a. October 25, 2024, in the amount of \$140,118.37.
 - 1) November 8, 2024, in the amount of \$152,771.28.
3. October 24, 2024, ACH payment in the amount of \$35,678.56
4. Approval of Minutes
 - a. October 22, 2024 - Regular Meeting
 - b. October 22, 2024 - Special Meeting

.....

VI. **Pending Business**

1. Public Hearing – Solicitation of public comments on the proposed 2025 fiscal year budgets.

Supervisor Buxar opened the public hearing at 7:19 p.m.

Bob Yager spoke regarding the 2025 fiscal year budget.

Supervisor Buxar closed the public hearing at 7:20 p.m.

2. Consideration of receiving and filing the September 30th, 2024, quarterly cash and investment report.

No action was taken on this agenda item.

DRAFT

3. Consideration of approving the proposal design alterations to the Southwest Water District water storage project.

Public Comment
John Markel Birch Hill
Bob Yager

Motion by Giannangeli, seconded by Langlois to approve OHM recommendation of item #9, which is a proposed external generator with sound-attenuated enclosure level 2 at location B.

Roll Call Vote

Ayes: Buxar, Mangiapane, Zale, Langlois, Giannangeli, Elder
Nays: Mabry
Absent: None

Motion carried 6/1.

4. Consideration of approving the proposal from VC3 to upgrade the firewall systems for the Township Hall, Fire Station #2 and the Paint Creek Cider Mill building.

Motion by Mabry, seconded by Giannangeli to approve the proposal from VC3 to upgrade the firewall systems in the amount of \$22,606.07 pending the approval of the Parks and Recreation Commission for the Paint Creek Cider Mill building, and to authorize Township Manager to sign the contract.

Motion was withdrawn by Mabry, agreed upon by seconder Giannangeli.

The Board of Trustees asked Township Manager Joseph Merucci to follow-up with VC3 regarding warranty and data breach concerns and place this item on the December 10th, 2024 meeting agenda.

5. Consideration of approving the request from Lieutenant Dooley, the sub-station commander, to lease 10 additional FLOCK cameras.

Motion by Elder, seconded by Mabry to approve the two-year contract with Flock Safety for an additional ten cameras at the cost of \$30,000 per year with an additional \$6,500 in the first year of installation of all ten cameras, for a total of \$66,500.

Motion carried 7/0.

Public Comment
Frank Ferriolo 5600

Board of Trustees Regular Meeting
November 12th, 2024
DRAFT

6. Review of the November 2nd, 2024, posting.

Motion by Langlois, seconded by Giannangeli to direct the Township Attorney to conduct a review of the legality of the publication and posting of allegations against an unnamed Board of Trustee Member made by the Oakland Township Clerk on November 2nd, 2024.

Public Comment:

Dan Bowie

John Markel

Frank Ferriolo

Ayes: Giannangeli, Mangiapane, Zale, Langlois

Nays: Buxar, Elder, Mabry

Motion carried 4/3.

.....

Editor's note: Below is the posting in question. It was posted for about two days - from Saturday, November 2 to Monday, November 4.



NEWS & HIGHLIGHTS

OAKLAND TOWNSHIP CLERK'S DEPARTMENT RESPONDS TO FALSE CLAIM OF BALLOT ERROR

This afternoon (November 2, 2024), a current Board of Trustee member falsely accused Oakland Township Clerk's Department of incorrectly issuing a ballot to her, alleging that it had been mailed with an inaccurate precinct designation. In response, the department promptly initiated a thorough investigation.

We are pleased to report that the investigation has confirmed the claim to be without merit. To date, no other claims or complaints regarding ballot errors have been reported. Further out of an abundance of caution, the Clerk's Department did a full audit of all precincts and found NO discrepancies.

There was considerable controversy during the discussion about the appropriateness / legality of this message and the quality of the investigation where the Clerk's Department investigates itself.

A complete account of the contentious discussions can be found in The Record, November 20-26 issue, page 1, headline - ***"Trustee alleges she got an irregular ballot"*** by reporter Stacy Sobotka, who attends all Board meetings. Subscribe here for \$15 annually on-line.

[Click here to start your subscription – The Record](#)

You can also see the 54 minute videotaped discussion here at agenda 6.6, [Board of Trustees - Nov. 12, 2024](#)

My understanding is that the legal investigation involves asking the Michigan Attorney General for an opinion.

.....

VII. Public Comment for items not on the Agenda

There were none.

VIII. Board Reports & Correspondence: Supervisor, Clerk, Treasurer, Trustees

Supervisor Buxar thanked Trustee Mangiapane and Trustee Zale for their service as Board of Trustee members.

Trustee Elder thanked Trustee Mangiapane and Trustee Zale and wished them luck.

Trustee Langlois welcomed new Board of Trustee members and thanked Trustee Mangiapane and Trustee Zale for their service.

Trustee Mangiapane stated that the Historic District Commission has finalized the Garling Barn contracts and expressed her pleasure working as the Board of Trustees Representative. Welcomed residents to tour the decorated farm house on December 15th, 2024 at Cranberry Lake Farm.

Trustee Zale thanked residents for trusting him serve on the Board of Trustees.

Clerk Mabry provided an update regarding unofficial election results, voter turnout, absentee ballots, and Early Voting.

Treasurer Giannangeli also thanked both Trustee Zale and Trustee Mangiapane and

Board of Trustees Regular Meeting

November 12th, 2024

DRAFT

welcomed residents to the Oakland Township Board of Trustees Ceremony on Wednesday, November 20th, 2024 at 7:00 p.m.

.....

Editor's Note: Trustee Jeanne Langlois' well thought-out comments on the contributions and positive attributes of Andy Zale and Lana Mangiapane were accurate and well-deserved by them.

.....

IX. Township Manager's Report

Township Manager Merucci stated that Township Hall will be closed on November 28th and 29th for the observance of Thanksgiving. The next regular Board of Trustees meeting will be held on Tuesday, December 12th.

X. Adjournment

Motion by Buxar, seconded by Mabry to adjourn the meeting at 10:24 p.m.

The next Regular Board of Trustees meeting will be held on Tuesday, December 12th, 2024 at 7:00 PM at the Oakland Township Hall Board Room, 4393 Collins Road, Rochester, MI.

Respectfully Submitted,

Approved,

Dave Mabry
Clerk

Robin Buxar
Supervisor